

# LAND USE, PLANNING AND ZONING COMMITTEE

Minutes of the Meeting of May 4, 2017

## Members Present

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Brad Flamm, Chair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Larry McEwen
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Cynthia Brey, Chair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Ned Mitinger
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Steve Gendler	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Andrew Moroz
<input type="checkbox"/> Larry Goldfarb	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Aga Vinson
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> John Landis	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> John Haak
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Joyce Lenhardt	<input type="checkbox"/> Laura Lucas, Pres, CHCA (ex-officio)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Jean McCoubrey	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Bob Rossman, VP Physical

## Others Attending Fire Station Design:

Vince Krakrows, City Public Properties  
Representatives of the Fire Department  
Cecil Baker, Cecil Baker + Architects  
Eric Leighton, Cecil Baker + architects  
Nicholas Connelly, Cecil Baker +Architects  
Harry Murray, Preservation Consultant for Cecil Baker + Architects  
John Romano  
Patricia Cove  
Others from Chestnut Hill Conservancy

## For LUPZC Regular Meeting

Martha Sharkey, CHBA  
Neighbors of the Fareway Beer Garden

## Others

Sample, Chestnut Hill *Local*  
Celeste Hardester  
Melissa Nash, recorder

Larry McEwen opened the meeting at 7:20 pm. This is a special joint meeting of the LUPC and HDAC presenting developing designs for the firehouse project as well as regular business.

## **Engine Company 37 Proposed Expansion**

•Presentation: He introduced Vince K of the City who stated that the city is happy with the progress of the design. The city is also happy with the roof restoration project, which is winding down. There are some unexpected problems with the chimney, which may delay the project slightly. Eric Leighton then reviewed the project, beginning with photos and location within the community. He then introduced Harry Murray, a preservation consultant. H Murray presented the history of the building, which was designed by John Torrey Windrim in 1894 who designed many other buildings in Philadelphia. The Romanesque style building is on the city register. The building was built of schist with limestone trim. The building is generally in good condition, although there is some weathering of the limestone, which varies from slight to extreme. A prioritized preservation plan would begin with the structure of the building, repair water damage and finally cosmetic repair. The roof is currently being restored including new flashings. The current windows are from the 1980s set within the frames of the original windows. They have smaller panes and odd frames and

should be replaced. The original garage doors were replaced in the 1950s. Paint analysis revealed colors of a subtle richness – warm gray and rich deep red on the windows. The original color palette should be brought back. The proposed new building connects to the old where the original connecting arch was located.

•Presentation cont.: E Leighton described the current doors as too narrow for today's equipment. The doors cannot be widened while maintaining the historic character. He showed the programming documents establishing the hierarchy and relationship of spaces. The central element is the equipment room. One bay in the old building would be a training room. He briefly reviewed the earlier concepts for the new building. The current design has the new addition moved a little apart from the old with a connection. The construction process would start with building the new building, then renovate the existing building and finally move in and use all. In detail, the watch room has been pushed back. The new bay doors would be bi-fold doors that open more quickly than overheads. The landscaping plan for the rear of the building has been developed. Bike parking would be located on Shawnee. No changes have been made to the second floor since the last design. Entry to the existing building would still be in the left opening. There would be an operable door and glass walls in the entry. In the new building there would be a larger separation between the doors.

•Further Presentation: Cecil Baker continued the presentation. He spoke of the persuasion of fitting in the new building as a fluid process of give and take, using the symmetry and asymmetry of the old building. Where it changes from symmetry to asymmetry, it is dramatic. There is order keeping chaos at the edges. The new garage is seen as a reflection in water of the old. Features are added to the blank wall; a shoji screen like panel reflecting the dormer. The brick base reflects the slate of the roof. Stone on the side wraps around to the front. The watch room wall is absolutely glass separating history and the new. The rear elevation has no alignments. It plays into the stonework with Kalwall on the top of the garage. E Leighton showed perspectives that include the watch. He also showed samples of materials from the old building and the proposed building. The brick base would be Roman brick with a 16" length in earthy brown color. The horizontal joints would be raked and would have lighter mortar. The sandstone portions will be clad in real sandstone. There would be gray metal details that will sparkle in the sunlight. The watch room will have clear glass where needed and frosted glass above and below vision area for privacy. There will be dark red and rich brown for the window frames, and doors. There will be copper downspouts and flashings. There will be paved paths and a small lawn in front of the old building and a specimen tree on the corner. The Shawnee sidewalk will be 5' wide allowing room for bike racks and some plantings. The rear will have a new fence and evergreens and varied plantings. Zoning variances will be needed. For the new building there will be lot line setback, a heritage tree to be removed, and a new curb cut. It is anticipated that the zoning application will be made in early July. After the refusals are received, the Project will return to the CHCA. Variances for the existing building include that it is non-conforming and the retaining wall. Also, the bike rack is too far from the primary entrance, lot coverage is greater than allowed and parking in the side yard is not allowed. There is no drive aisle and no handicap parking.

•Committee/Audience Discussion: Patricia Cove asked about the color of the glass on the watch. The sample is slightly green; the perspective shows it bluish. The color of the glass had not yet been determined. There is a line at the top edge of the watch, which is a metal eyebrow continuing the line of the garage. Cynthia Brey asked about the new doors. They line up with the existing transom. The flag pole is an addition to the building. A member of the audience noted that the watch seems esthetically out of place in material, shape, and color. C Baker stated that the watch is a gap, a neutral element separating the old and the contemporary. It should be interesting at night. J Landis

thanked everyone for the presentation. The behold door are a great change although is a problem the added width between the doors. The flashing/coping creates a shadow line that is not on the center piece. It is also good that the watch room has been tucked back.

### **Screen Fencing for Trash Compactor**

- Presentation: Martha Sharkey made a brief presentation for review. A 9” fence is needed. It would be red cedar, painted Chestnut Hill dark green. The decision has not yet been made between a 6’ solid with 3’ trellis or a 7’ solid with a 2’ trellis. The zoning notice has been posted. Ned Mitinger asked what would be more unsightly – the fence or the compactor. M Sharkey added that shrubs would be used to soften the fence as would vines. The fence would help contain any trash that escaped and would hold the control boards. Planting would primarily on the street side. The proposal has been approved in theory by LUPZC and DRC. Letters have been sent to neighbors. The compactor is 8’-8” high. It was asked if there were any objections. It was suggested that mockups of the two fences be shown.

- Committee Action: Larry McEwen moved that the committee uphold the board support of the project. The motion was seconded and passed.

### **Beer Garden at the Fareway 8229 Germantown Avenue**

- Presentation: Neighbors of the new beer garden at the Fareway presented their distress at the opening of the addition to the brewery. The beer garden is open 5 days a week until 10. There are already many establishments in this area including Jenks School, the Avenue, the Water Tower and parking lots with lighting. The zoning permit states there will be no additional seating but there is seating in the exterior space. The neighbors have a set of covenants which are written into the property’s deed. Joyce Lenhardt explained the process that comes into action when there is a variance needed. Mary Dempsey Lau, a neighbor, noted that the permits – zoning, building and liquor – have been improperly handled, including improper posting. John Landis stated that the committee might be able to help guide the neighbors through their complaints. Jay Overcash, a neighbor and participant in the creation of the covenants in 1979, noted that Ron Peet is a new owner. The whole project seems to have become too big. L McEwen noted that the neighbors can report problems and violations to the entities involved, the City and the Liquor Control Board. N Mitinger also suggested that the neighbors talk to the Community Manager about their concerns. Neighbors need to review the covenants carefully and need to have a formal meeting with the owner.

### **Jenks School Updates**

- Discussion: Lynn Hortter, an Ardleigh neighbor of Jenks, stated that there has been parking on the upper level since the ramp was completed. The dumpsters are still left on the sidewalk on a regular basis. The gates to the upper level are left open when school is closed. IT was suggested that L&I, 311 and Cindy Bass be contacted. In addition, Laura Luca could send a letter to the School District of Philadelphia. Bob Rossman and Joyce Lenhardt will talk to Laura Lucas. It was noted that the SDP is doing a study of school deficiencies.

- Minutes Review: The April minutes (prepared by Larry McEwen) were presented and reviewed. It was moved the minutes be accepted as presented. The motion was seconded and approved.

### **Adjournment**

- The meeting was adjourned at 9:45PM